

1 BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP  
2 RICHARD J. POCKER (NV Bar No. 3568)  
3 300 South Fourth Street, Suite 800  
4 Las Vegas, NV 89101  
5 Telephone: (702) 382-7300  
6 Facsimile: (702) 382-2755  
7 rponce@bsfllp.com

8 BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP  
9 WILLIAM ISAACSON (*pro hac vice*)  
10 KAREN DUNN (*pro hac vice*)  
11 5301 Wisconsin Ave, NW  
12 Washington, DC 20015  
13 Telephone: (202) 237-2727  
14 Facsimile: (202) 237-6131  
15 wisaacson@bsfllp.com  
16 kdunn@bsfllp.com

17 BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP  
18 STEVEN C. HOLTZMAN (*pro hac vice*)  
19 KIERAN P. RINGGENBERG (*pro hac vice*)  
20 1999 Harrison Street, Suite 900  
21 Oakland, CA 94612  
22 Telephone: (510) 874-1000  
23 Facsimile: (510) 874-1460  
24 sholtzman@bsfllp.com  
25 kringgenberg@bsfllp.com

26 Attorneys for Oracle USA, Inc., Oracle  
27 America, Inc., and Oracle International  
28 Corporation

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF NEVADA**

**20** ORACLE USA, INC., a Colorado corporation;  
**21** ORACLE AMERICA, INC. a Delaware  
corporation; and ORACLE INTERNATIONAL  
**22** CORPORATION, a California corporation.

23 Plaintiffs

v.

**24** RIMINI STREET, INC., a Nevada corporation;  
**25** SETH RAVIN, an individual.

## 26 Defendants.

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP  
THOMAS S. HIXSON (*pro hac vice*)  
KRISTEN A. PALUMBO (*pro hac vice*)  
Three Embarcadero Center  
San Francisco, CA 94111-4067  
Telephone: 415.393.2000  
Facsimile: 415.393.2286  
[thomas.hixson@bingham.com](mailto:thomas.hixson@bingham.com)  
[kristen.palumbo@bingham.com](mailto:kristen.palumbo@bingham.com)

DORIAN DALEY (*pro hac vice*)  
DEBORAH K. MILLER (*pro hac vice*)  
JAMES C. MAROULIS (*pro hac vice*)  
ORACLE CORPORATION  
500 Oracle Parkway, M/S 5op7  
Redwood City, CA 94070  
Telephone: 650.506.4846  
Facsimile: 650.506.7114  
[dorian.daley@oracle.com](mailto:dorian.daley@oracle.com)  
[deborah.miller@oracle.com](mailto:deborah.miller@oracle.com)  
[jim.maroulis@oracle.com](mailto:jim.maroulis@oracle.com)

Case No. 2:10-cv-00106-LRH-PAL

**PLAINTIFFS ORACLE'S MOTION  
TO SEAL THEIR MOTION TO  
EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF  
DEFENDANTS' EXPERTS SCOTT  
HAMPTON, BROOKS HILLIARD,  
DAVID KLAUSNER, AND JAMES  
BENGE AND SUPPORTING  
DOCUMENTS**

Judge: Hon. Larry R. Hicks

1 Pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order governing confidentiality of documents  
 2 entered by the Court on May 21, 2010, Dkt. 55 (“Protective Order”), and Rules 5.2 and 26(c) of  
 3 the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Plaintiffs Oracle USA, Inc., Oracle America, Inc., and  
 4 Oracle International Corporation (together “Oracle” or “Plaintiffs”) respectfully request that the  
 5 Court order the Clerk of the Court to file under seal an unredacted copy of Oracle’s Motion to  
 6 Exclude Testimony of Defendants’ Experts Scott Hampton, Brooks Hilliard, David Klausner,  
 7 and James Benge (“Motion”) and supporting Exhibits.<sup>1</sup> Unredacted copies of the Motion and  
 8 Exhibits were individually lodged under seal with the Court on July 22, 2015.

9 Sealing of the unredacted Motion and Exhibits is requested because the redacted portions  
 10 of it contain information that Rimini Street, Inc. and Seth Ravin (collectively the “Defendants”),  
 11 have designated as “Confidential Information” and “Highly Confidential Information –  
 12 Attorneys’ Eyes Only” under the terms of the Protective Order. The Protective Order states,  
 13 “Counsel for any Designating Party may designate any Discovery Material as ‘Confidential  
 14 Information’ and ‘Highly Confidential Information – Attorneys’ Eyes Only’ under the terms of  
 15 this Protective Order only if such counsel in good faith believes that such Discovery Material  
 16 contains such information and is subject to protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure  
 17 26(c). The designation by any Designating Party of any Discovery Material as ‘Confidential  
 18 Information’ or ‘Highly Confidential Information – Attorneys’ Eyes Only’ shall constitute a  
 19 representation that an attorney for the Designating Party reasonably believes there is a valid basis  
 20 for such designation.” Protective Order ¶ 2.

21 For sealing requests relating to non-dispositive motions, such as this, the presumption of  
 22 public access to court filings may be overcome by a showing of good cause under Rule 26(c).  
 23 See *Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass’n*, 605 F.3d 665, 678 (9th Cir. 2010); *Kamakana v. Honolulu*,  
 24 447 F.3d 1172, 1179 (9th Cir. 2006). Defendants have identified the information redacted in the  
 25 \_\_\_\_\_

26 <sup>1</sup> All Exhibits referred to in this motion are attached to the Appendix of Exhibits in Support of  
 27 Oracle’s Motion to Exclude Testimony of Defendants’ Experts Scott Hampton, Brooks Hilliard,  
 David Klausner, and James Benge.

1 Motion as well as the Exhibits as Confidential and Highly Confidential, and therefore  
 2 Defendants have represented that good cause exists for sealing those portions of the documents.  
 3 This is a sufficient showing of good cause to permit a sealing order on a non-dispositive motion.  
 4 *See, e.g., Pac. Gas & Elec. Co. v. Lynch*, 216 F. Supp. 2d 1016, 1027 (N.D. Cal. 2002).

5 Likewise, sealing of the unredacted Exhibits is also requested because they contain  
 6 information designated as “Confidential Information” and “Highly Confidential Information –  
 7 Attorneys’ Eyes Only” by Oracle.

8 Exhibit 9 contains information from the Expert Report of Ms. Elizabeth Dean which, in  
 9 turn, contains non-public financial information regarding Oracle’s operations. Oracle designated  
 10 such material “Highly Confidential,” which reflects, in Oracle’s best judgment, that the  
 11 documents contain “extremely sensitive, highly confidential, non-public information, consisting  
 12 either of trade secrets or other highly confidential documents related to current or future business  
 13 plans, protocols or strategies, the disclosure of which . . . would be likely to cause competitive or  
 14 business injury to [Oracle] (other than injury to [Oracle’s] position in this Action).” Protective  
 15 Order ¶ 4. Such information is properly sealed. *See Apple Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.*, 727 F.3d  
 16 1214, 1225 (Fed. Cir. 2013) (sealing financial information under compelling reason standard).  
 17 The Court has previously granted a motion to seal excerpts from Ms. Dean’s Report. Dkt. 633.

18 Exhibit 16, excerpts of the deposition of Brooks L. Hilliard, contains material from  
 19 license agreements between Oracle and its customers. Oracle designated each of those  
 20 agreements “Highly Confidential,” which reflects, in Oracle’s best judgment, that the documents  
 21 contain “extremely sensitive, highly confidential, non-public information, consisting either of  
 22 trade secrets or other highly confidential documents related to current or future business plans,  
 23 protocols or strategies, the disclosure of which . . . would be likely to cause competitive or  
 24 business injury to [Oracle] (other than injury to [Oracle’s] position in this Action).” Protective  
 25 Order ¶ 4. In particular, these license agreements contain confidential terms related to the  
 26 customers’ licensed use of Oracle’s enterprise software. Oracle has invested billions to acquire  
 27 and develop this software, and it relies on licensing to recoup some of those costs. Disclosure of  
 28 the confidential terms of the licenses could interfere with Oracle’s ongoing licensing efforts.

1 Thus, there is a basis for this material to be sealed. *Selling Source, LLC v. Red River Ventures,*  
 2 *LLC*, 2:09-CV-01491-JCM, 2011 WL 1630338 \*6 (D. Nev. Apr. 29, 2011) (citing *Pintos*, 565  
 3 F.3d at 1115 n. 4). The Court has previously sealed similar materials in connection with  
 4 summary judgment briefing. Dkt. 325 at 2.

5

6 **TESTIMONY AND DOCUMENTS DESIGNATED AS CONFIDENTIAL**  
**OR HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY**

7

8 Defendants have designated the following materials cited or referred to in Oracle’s  
 9 Motion as Confidential or Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only:

10

EX. NO.	DESCRIPTION	CONF. DESIGN.
1	Email from Beth Lester to Dennis Chiu, which has been marked as PTX 2152.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
2	Email from Beth Lester, to Seth Ravin, which has been marked as PTX 18.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
3	Email from Dennis Chiu to George Lester copying Seth Ravin and Michael Davichick, which has been marked as PTX 20.	Confidential (by Rimini)
4	Email from Krista Williams to Jeff Allen, which has been marked as PTX 50.	Confidential (by Rimini)
5	Weekly Status Report for Jeff Allen from 2/8/2009 to 2/14/2009, which has been marked as PTX 51.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
6	Email from Brian Slepko to Jeff Allen, Susan Tahtaras and Dennis Chiu, which has been marked as PTX 52.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
7	Email from Ed Freeman to Jim Benge, copying Brenda Davenport, Dennis Chiu, Kevin Maddock, Krista Williams, Sara Lu, and Tim Conley, which has been marked as PTX 60.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
8	Expert Report of Elizabeth A. Dean.	Highly Confidential (by Oracle)
9	Expert Report of Christian B. Hicks.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
10	Expert Report of Brooks L. Hilliard.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)

28

1	10A	Expert Report of Brooks L. Hilliard with portions subject to Motion to Exclude highlighted in grey.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
2	11	Expert Report of David Klausner.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
3	11A	Expert Report of David Klausner with portions subject to Motion to Exclude highlighted in grey.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
4	12	Expert Report of Scott D. Hampton.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
5	12A	Expert Report of Scott D. Hampton with portions subject to Motion to Exclude highlighted in grey.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
6	13	Rebuttal Report to the Expert Report of David Klausner by Christian B. Hicks.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
7	14	Excerpts from the deposition of Scott D. Hampton, taken on May 25, 2012.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini)
8	15	Excerpts from the deposition of Brooks L. Hilliard, taken on June 5, 2012.	Highly Confidential (by Rimini); Highly Confidential (by Oracle)
9	16	Excerpts from the deposition of David Klausner, taken on June 15, 2015.	Confidential (by Rimini)
10	17	Excerpts from the deposition of Jim Benge, taken on June 21, 2012.	Confidential (by Rimini)
11	19	Oracle Customer Connection Terms of Use, which has been marked as PTX 19.	Confidential (by Oracle)
12	20	Instant message between c_limburg and kpedn, which has been marked as PTX 48.	Confidential (by Rimini)

22

23

Oracle has submitted all other exhibits in the Appendix to the Court's public files, which would allow public access to all Exhibits except for the items listed above. Accordingly, the request to seal is narrowly tailored.

24

25

26

27

28

For the foregoing reasons, Oracle respectfully requests that the Court find that good cause exists to file under seal the unredacted copies of the Motion and above-listed Exhibits, and to

1 issue an order sealing the same.

2 DATED: July 22, 2015

BOIES SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

3

4

By: /s/ Kieran P. Ringgenberg

5

Kieran P. Ringgenberg

6

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

7

Oracle USA, Inc., Oracle America, Inc.,  
and Oracle International Corp.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1                   **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

2                   I hereby certify that on the 22nd day of July, 2015, I electronically transmitted the  
3 foregoing **PLAINTIFFS ORACLE'S MOTION TO SEAL THEIR MOTION TO**  
4 **EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF DEFENDANTS' EXPERTS SCOTT HAMPTON,**  
5 **BROOKS HILLIARD, DAVID KLAUSNER, AND JAMES BENGE AND SUPPORTING**  
6 **DOCUMENTS** to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a  
7 Notice of Electronic Filing to all counsel in this matter; all counsel being registered to receive  
8 Electronic Filing.

9  
10                   \_\_\_\_\_  
11                   /s/ Catherine Duong  
12                   An employee of Boies, Schiller & Flexner LLP

13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28